

CARBON SEQUESTRATION:

A BETTER ALTERNATIVE FOR CLIMATE CHANGE?

Maryland School of Public Affairs

University of Maryland

July 1999

PREFACE

This study has been conducted as part of the Policy Workshop at the School of Public Affairs of the University of Maryland at College Park. Each year, this course dedicates the full spring semester to the study of one important environmental topic. Each student is expected to spend at least 10 hours per week in this effort. Collectively the 13 master's students who have done the research for this report devoted more than 2,000 hours to the study of carbon sequestration policy issues.

Although this report is a collaborative project among all students, the following students were principally responsible for the first drafts of the chapters: Chapter 1 – Kathryn Bokowy and Stacey Warthen; Chapter 2 - Paget Graham; Chapter 3 – Nathan Knuffman; Chapter 4 – Jacob Schmidt and Erin Wuchte; Chapter 5 – Laura Hatfield, Gustavo Silva-Chavez, and Marcia Tannian; Chapter 6 – Laura Hatfield and Marcia Tannian; Chapter 7 – Jeri Smith-Ready; Chapter 8 – Jason Benis; Chapter 9 – Michelle Straughn; and Chapter 10 – Brian Stranko.

The participating students are enrolled in the Master's Program at the School of Public Affairs. Their undergraduate degrees span a wide range including economics, political science, English, environmental studies, Russian language and literature, and others. The work has been conducted under the supervision of professor Robert Nelson of the School of Public Affairs.

Contributing Authors

Jason Benis
Kathryn Bokowy
Laura Hatfield
Paget Graham
Nathan Knuffman
Jacob Schmidt
Gustavo Silva-Chavez
Jeri Smith-Ready
Brian Stranko
Michelle Straughn
Marcia Tannian
Stacey Warthen
Erin Wuchte

TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

.....ix

INTRODUCTION

.....xix

PART I -- METHODS OF CARBON SEQUESTRATION

CHAPTER 1 -- AGRICULTURAL SINKS

The Role of Carbon in Agricultural Soils	
1.1 Carbon Sequestration and Farm Management	4
Soil Erosion Management	
Land Restoration and Reclamation	
Conservation Tillage	
Residue Management	
Crop Rotation	
1.2 Economics of Agricultural Sequestration	7
Profitability of Conservation Tillage	
Studies in Indiana and Iowa	
Soybeans and Conservation Tillage	
Corn and Conservation Tillage	
1.3 Environmental Benefits of Agricultural Sinks	10
1.4 Obstacles to Agricultural Sequestration	10
Issues in Soil Sequestration	
1.5 Federal Disincentives	12
1.6 Policy Options	14
Farmer Incentives for Carbon Sequestration	
Carbon Tax Credits	
Carbon Credit Trading Program	
Payments for Carbon Farming	
Federal Start-Up Subsidies, Loans and Programs	
Water Quality Law Enforcement	
Carbon Sequestering Soil Additives	
1.7 Conclusion	16
References	

Appendices

CHAPTER 2 -- CARBON SEQUESTRATION THROUGH BIOMASS ENERGY

2.1 A Brief History of Biomass23

2.2 Agricultural Sources of Biomass24

2.3 Uses of Biomass for Energy Generation26

2.4 Economic Feasibility of Biomass28

2.5 Further Benefits of Biomass Sources of Energy29

2.6 Environmental Problems with Biomass30

2.7 Marine Biomass31

2.8 Conclusions33

References

CHAPTER 3 – SEQUESTRATION OF CARBON DIOXIDE FROM POWER PLANT EMISSIONS

3.1 Types of “Technological” Sinks38

 Chemical Absorption

 Adsorption

 Cryogenic Processes

 Membranes

3.2 Costs of CO₂ Capture39

3.3 Storage42

 Ocean Disposal

 Terrestrial Disposal

 Aquifers

 Exhausted Oil and Gas Wells

 Enhanced Oil Recovery (EOR)

 Enhanced Coalbed Methane Production

 Chemicals

 Direct Biofixation

 Storage Limitations

3.4 Research and Development46

 Need for Further Research

3.5 Conclusion

.....	48
References	

CHAPTER 4 -- FORESTRY SINKS

4.1 Reforestation Sink Potential	55
.....	
Marginal Cropland and Pasture Land	
4.2 Increased Sink Potential of Existing Forests	58
.....	
More Intensive Replanting	
Improved Management Practices	
4.3 Urban Forestry	61
.....	
4.4 Total Forest Potential	63
.....	
4.5 Cost Effectiveness	63
.....	
4.6 Environmental Impacts	65
.....	
4.7 Policy Options	66
.....	
4.8 Conclusion	67
.....	
References	
Appendices	

PART II – U.S. CREDITS FOR SEQUESTRATION OF CARBON IN OTHER COUNTRIES

CHAPTER 5 – INTERNATIONAL SINK OFFSETS AND CREDITS

5.1 Worldwide Forest Sink Potential	78
.....	
Preventing Deforestation	
5.2 International Carbon Trading	82
.....	
5.3 The USIJI Pilot Projects and Other AIJ Programs	83
.....	
Selected Case Studies	
CARE/Guatemala Agroforestry Project	
Face Foundation in Krkonose and Sumava National Parks, Czech Republic	
USIJI in Piedras Blancas National Park, Costa Rica	
USIJI in Saratov, Russia	

5.4 Conclusion86

References

Appendix

CHAPTER 6 – BASELINE, LEAKAGE AND OTHER POLICY ISSUES IN CARBON ACCOUNTING

6.1 Defining Baselines in Practice94

- Boundaries
- Inclusion of Forest Soils and Other Vegetation
- Deforestation Baselines
- Natural Regeneration
- Reducing Obscurity
- Other Baseline Methodologies: “Top-down” baselines

6.2 The Problem of Leakage98

- CARFIX
- Protecting Through Purchase
- Leakage Lessons

6.3 Establishing Reporting and Monitoring Systems101

- Reporting
- Monitoring
- Reporting and Monitoring Practices
- Transparency
- Technical Soundness
- Cost Effectiveness

6.4 Property Rights104

6.5 Conclusion106

References

Appendix

CHAPTER 7 – PRIVATE BROKERING OF CARBON OFFSETS AND CREDITS

7.1 U.S. Carbon Brokers113

- Trexler and Associates
- UtiliTree
- DOE’s Climate Challenge

7.2 Brokerage Activities in Other Countries116

- Voluntary Challenge and Registry (Canada)
- Greenhouse Gas Emission Reduction Trading Pilot (Canada)

Woodrising Consulting Inc. (Canada)	
Carbon Storage Trust (Great Britain)	
Société Générale de Surveillance	
7.3 Acceptable Project Criteria	118
Trexler and Associates	
UtiliTree	
Voluntary Challenge and Registry (Canada)	
Greenhouse Gas Emission Reduction and Trading Program (Canada)	
Carbon Storage Trust (Great Britain)	
SGS Group (International)	
7.4 Conclusion	123
References	

PART III – POLITICAL ECONOMY OF CARBON SEQUESTRATION

CHAPTER 8 – DOMESTIC POLITICS OF SINKS

8.1 Environmental Groups	127
Supporters	
Opponents	
Cautiously Undecided	
8.2 Business Groups	130
Supporters	
Undecided or Undeclared Opposition	
8.3 Selected Congressional Views	134
8.4 Conclusion	136
References	

CHAPTER 9 – SINKS AND CLIMATE CHANGE IN THE CLINTON ADMINISTRATION

9.1 Sink and Other Funding in the U.S. Climate Change Budget	140
USCGRP Funding	
CCTI Funding	
Funding for International Programs	
Recommendations for R & D Budget	
9.2 Agency Programs Relating to Carbon Sinks	145
Department of Energy	
Environmental Protection Agency	

Department of Agriculture	
Carbon Cycle Science Program	
Recommendations for Agencies	
9.3 U.S Official Positions on Sinks in International Negotiations	
.....	148
Geneva Convention	
Climate Action Report of 1997	
Kyoto Convention	
Buenos Aires Convention	
IPCC Special 2000 Report	
9.4 Conclusion	
.....	151
References	
CHAPTER 10 – OBTAINING EARLY ACTION CREDIT FOR CARBON	
10.1 Development of the DOE Voluntary Reporting Program	
.....	153
10.2 Carbon Sequestration in the Early Action Program	
.....	154
10.3 Reporting and Measuring Forestry Activities	
.....	155
Estimation Methods	
10.4 Reference Cases	
.....	156
Scope: Levels of Reporting	
Scope: Domestic/International	
10.5 Conclusion	
.....	160
References	
Appendix	
CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS	
.....	167

.....	64
Table 4.7 – Per Unit Cost for Various Land Uses	
.....	65
Table 4.8 – Unit Sequestration Costs for Seedling and Forest Project	
.....	71
Table 5.1 – Worldwide Carbon Sequestration Potentials	
.....	79
Table 5.2 – Cost of Protecting Forests	
.....	81
Table 5.3 – Partial List of Activities Implemented Jointly under Pilot Phase	
.....	84
Table 7.1 – UtiliTree Carbon Sequestration Projects	
.....	115
Table 9.1 – Federal Programs Directly Related or Associated with Global Climate	
.....	141
Table 9.2 – Funding for the U.S. Climate Change Research Program	
.....	142
Table 9.3 – Program Funding in Climate Change Technology Initiative	
.....	143
Table 9.4 – Funding for International Programs Directly Related to Climate Change	
.....	144
Table 10.1 – DOE Voluntary Reporting Program Reduction and Sequestration 1994-1997	
.....	154
Table 10.2 – Distribution of Sequestration	
.....	155
Table 10.3 – Pacificorp – Examples of Projects Reported in 1997	
.....	157

List of Figures

Figure 1 – CO ₂ and Climate Change	xxxiii
Figure 2 – The World Carbon Cycle Equation	xxxiii
Figure 3 – The Kyoto Protocol Terminology	xxv
Figure 1.1 – Types of Tillage Systems	5
Figure 2.1 – Uses of Biomass	25
Figure 3.1 – The Technological Sink Process	38
Figure 4.1 – Simplified Diagram of Forest Carbon Stocks and Fluxes	53
Figure 4.2 – Example of Average Carbon Uptake for a Specific Forest Type	54
Figure 4.3 – Carbon Storage Potential of Converted Marginal Lands	56
Figure 4.4 – Geographic Distribution of Marginal Crop and Pastureland	56
Figure 6.1 – Baselines, Leakages and Additionality	93
Figure 10.1 – Project Description: Cinery Forestry Projects	159
Figure 10.2 – Project Description: DTE Energy/Detroit Edison Miscellaneous Tree Plantings 1995	159

List of Appendices

Appendix 1A – Costs, Yields, and Profits in Indiana from 1991-1996	20
Appendix 1B – Study of Yields in Iowa from 1992-1995	20
Appendix 1C – CTIC Study of U.S. Tillage Systems by Type of Crop 1998	21
Appendix 1D – Conservation Tillage Trends 1989-1998	21
Appendix 4 – Cost Effectiveness of Forestry Sinks by Type of Tree Species	70
Appendix 4A – Individual Seedling Cost and Quantity per Hectare	73

Appendix 4B – Discounted Costs Over the Lifetime of Project	74
Appendix 4C – Average Annual Rental Rates by Region	75
Appendix 4D – Costs with Total Cost of Land Included	75
Appendix 4E – Impacts of Logging	76
Appendix 5 – USIJI Pilot Carbon Sequestration Projects	90
Appendix 6 – A Sketch for a New Carbon Accounting System	111
Appendix 10 – Types of Carbon Sequestration Projects in the DOE Voluntary Reporting Program	166

